



مدينة زويل للعلوم والتكن ولوجيا

Space and Communications Engineering - Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control - Fall 2016

Discrete Motion Planning

Lecture 8 – Thursday November 23, 2016

Objectives

When you have finished this lecture you should be able to:

- Recognize what a motion plan is, what it is supposed to achieve, requirements of a path planner, how to represent a plan, how to measure the quality of a plan and different planning algorithms available.
- Understand different **discrete planning algorithms**.

Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning
- Breadth-first Search (BFS)
- Depth-first Search (DFS)
- Dijkstra's Algorithm
- Best-first
- A* Algorithm

Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning
- Breadth-first Search (BFS)
- Depth-first Search (DFS)
- Dijkstra's Algorithm
- Best-first
- A* Algorithm

Planning

Planning is a complex activity that determines a **future course of actions/activities** for an executing entity to drives it from an **initial state** to a specified **goal state**. Planning often involves reasoning with incomplete information.



Planning is everywhere





Rubik's cube

Sliding Puzzle

AI Discrete Planning [1]



Robot Manipulator Planning



Piano Mover Problem [1]

Unmanned Ground Vehicles (UGV)



Unmanned **Aerial Vehicles** (UAV) & Micro **Aerial Vehicles** (MAV)



Unmanned

Surface

Vehicles

(USV)



Unmanned Underwater Vehicles (UUV)

Unmanned Vehicles (UXVs) Planning

Motion Planning

A robot has to compute a **collision-free path** from a start position (s) to a given goal position (G), amidst a collection of obstacles.



Articulated Robot

Rigid Robot

Planning Overview



- Planning Overview: Planning Environment
 Different planning approaches for different environments.
 Modeling Dimensions:
 - **Structure:** structured versus unstructured.
 - **Observerability:** fully versus partially observable.
 - **Determinism:** deterministic versus stochastic.
 - **Continuity:** discrete versus continuous.
 - Adversary: benign versus adversarial.

- - -

• Number of agents: single agent versus multiagent.

- Planning Overview: Planning Environment Kinds of events that trigger planning [2]:
 - **Time-based:** for example, a plan for automated guided vehicle (AGV) needs to be made each season.



 Disturbance-based: a plan must be adjusted because a disturbance occurs that renders the plan invalid- for example, unexpected moving obstacle in the robot way.



For reading: Can You Program Ethics Into a Self-Driving Car?

Planning Process



- Initial state
- Goal state
- Possible states of the robot(s)
- Primitive actions or activities
- Hard and soft constraints
- Uncertainty (sensor and actuators)
- A priori knowledge

- C-Space configuration
- Graph Decomposition
- Cell decomposition
- Road maps
- Potential fields

• ...

- Discrete Planning
- Combinatorial Planning
- Sampling-based Planning
- Potential Field Method
- Metaheuristics
- Planning under Uncertainty
- Hybrid approaches

• ...

- Natural Questions:
 - ♦ What is a plan?
 - ♦ What is plan supposed to achieve?
 - ♦ What are the requirements of a path planner?
 - ♦ How is an environment transformed?
 - ♦ How will plan quality be evaluated?
 - ♦ Who or what is going to use the plan?
 - What are the different planning algorithms?

• What is a plan?





```
PROC main()
go_wait_position;
WHILE Dinput(finish)=0 Do
IF Dinput(defected_piece)=1 THEN
SetDO activate_belt,0;
pick_piece
SetDO activate_belt,1;
place_piece
go_wait_position;
ENDIF
ENDWHILE
ENDPROC
```

!Move to initial position !wait end program signal !Wait defected piece signal !Stop belt !Pick the defected piece !Activate the belt !Place the defected piece !Move to the initial position

Plan: Activity Diagram

ABB RAPID Program

- What is a plan?
 - Suppose that we have a tiny mobile
 robot that can move along the floor in a building.
 - The task is to determine a path that it should follow from a starting location to a goal location, while avoiding collisions.
 - A reasonable model can be formulated by assuming that the robot is a moving point in a two-dimensional environment that contains obstacles.



- What is a plan?
 - The task is to design an algorithm that
 accepts an obstacle region defined by a
 set of polygons, an initial position, and
 a goal position.
 - The algorithm must return a path that will bring the robot from the initial position to the goal position, while only traversing the free space.



- What is plan supposed to achieve?
 - ♦ A plan might simply **specify a sequence of actions** to be taken; however, it may be more complicated.
 - ♦ If it is impossible to **predict future states**, the plan may provide actions as a **function of state**.
 - ♦ In this case, **regardless of future states**, the appropriate action is determined.
 - It might even be the case that the state cannot be measured.
 - In this case, the action must be chosen based on whatever information is available up to the current time.

- What are the requirements of a path planner?
 - 1. to **find a path** through a **mapped environment** so that the robot can travel along it without colliding with anything,
 - 2. to **handle uncertainty** in the sensed world model and **errors** in **path execution**,
 - 3. to **minimize** the impact of objects on the field of view of the robot's sensors by keeping the robot **away from** those objects,
 - 4. to find the **optimum path**, if that path is to be **negotiated** regularly.

- What are the requirements of a path planner?
 - 5. Determine the following:
 - Horizon: What time/space span does the plan cover? Receding Horizon Control/planning (RHC)
 - Frequency: How often is the plan created or adapted?



- Level of detail: Does the plan need more detail in order to be executed? Does the executing entity have to fill in the details, or the plan used as a template for another planner (multiresolutional planning)?
- (Re)presentation: How is the plan represented and depicted? Does it specify the end state, or does it provide a process description that leads to the end state?

2

- How is an environment transformed?
 - The first step of any path-planning system is to transform the continuous environmental model into a discrete map suitable for the chosen path-planning algorithm.
 - Path planners differ as to how they effect this **discrete decomposition**.



How is an environment transformed?



Cell decomposition: discriminate between free and occupied cells.

How is an environment transformed?



Road map: identify a set of routes within the free space.

Potential field: impose a mathematical function over the space.



- Configuration space
 - Configuration space (C-Space) is the set of legal configurations of the robot.
 - C-Space also defines the topology of continuous motions.
 Transform.



Source: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zLEIWt6XZDY</u>

Configuration space For both articulated robots and rigid-object robots (no joints) there exists a transformation to the robot and obstacles that **turns the robot** into a single point. The C-Space Transform.



• **Configuration space** Assume the following:

 \mathcal{A} : a rigid/articulated **robot**; \mathcal{W} : the **workspace** (i.e., the Cartesian space in which the robot moves); $\mathcal{A}(q)$: the subset of the workspace that is occupied by the robot at configuration q \mathcal{O}_i : the **obstacles** in the workspace;



$\mathcal{O} = \bigcup \mathcal{O}_i$, **obstructive region** and

C : **configuration space**, which is the set of all possible configurations. A complete specification of the location of every point on the robot is referred to as a configuration.

Configuration space

 $\mathcal{C}_{obs}: \textbf{configuration space obstacle}, \\ which is the set of configurations for \\ which the robot collides with an \\ obstacle, \mathcal{C}_{obs} \subseteq \mathcal{C}$

$$\mathcal{C}_{\text{obs}} = \{q \in \mathcal{C} | \mathcal{A}(q) \cap \mathcal{O} \neq \phi\}$$



The set of collision-free configurations, referred to as the **free configuration space**, is then simply $C_{\text{free}} = C \setminus C_{\text{obs}}$

$$\mathcal{C} = \mathcal{C}_{\text{free}} \cup \mathcal{C}_{\text{obs}}$$

Configuration space

The **path planning problem** is to find a path from an initial configuration q_{init} to a final configuration q_{final} , such that the robot does not collide with any obstacle as it traverses the path.



A collision-free path from q_{init} to q_{final} is a continuous map, $\mathcal{T}: [0,1] \rightarrow \mathcal{C}_{free}$

with $\mathcal{T}(0) = q_{init}$ and $\mathcal{T}(1) = q_{final}$

Configuration space: Articulated Robots
 Consider a two-link planar arm in a workspace containing a single obstacle



Configuration space: Rigid Robots



Workspace

Configuration Space

C-Space Transform Examples



Where can I move this robot in the vicinity of this obstacle Where can I move this point in the vicinity of this expanded obstacle



Object-growth Algorithm

- 1. Attach a **coordinate frame** to the reference point,
- **2.** Flip the robot about the two axes of the coordinate frame, one axis at a time.
- 3. Place the reference point of the flipped robot at **each of the vertices of the object** and calculate the positions of the vertices of the robot.
- 4. Find the **convex hull of the vertices**. The convex hull is the convex polygon formed by stretching a rubber band around the vertices.

Object-growth Algorithm

1. Attach a coordinate frame to the reference point,



2. Flip the robot about the two axes of the coordinate frame, one axis at a time.



Reading Material

Object-growth Algorithm

3. Place the reference point of the flipped robot at each of the vertices of the object and calculate the positions of the vertices of the robot.



4. Find the convex hull of the vertices. The convex hull is the convex polygon formed by stretching a rubber band around the vertices.



Reading Material

Convex hull Algorithm: Sklansky's Algorithm

- 1. Place vertices into a counter-clockwise ordered list
- 2. Allocate a stack
- 3. Push vertex o onto stack
- 4. Push vertex 1 onto stack
- **5.** For *i*=2 to n **do**

{compare vertex *i* to ray formed by the 2 vertices at the top of the stack}

if vertex *i* is on or to the right of the ray (stacktop-1, stacktop) then

pop {discard top element of stack}

End

push vertex i {put vertex i onto stack}

End

Reading Material



Convex hull Algorithm: Sklansky's Algorithm



1	1	-	1,0
2	2	1	2,0
3	3	2	3,0
4	4	-	4,3,0
5	5	4	5,3,0
6	6	5	6,3,0
7	7	6	7,3,0
8	8	-	8,7,3,0
9	9	8	9,7,3,0

Reading Material

Point

0

Repeat...

• How will plan quality be evaluated?



• Who or what is going to use the plan?


Introductory Concepts

What are the different planning algorithms?



Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning
- Breadth-first Search (BFS)
- Depth-first Search (DFS)
- Dijkstra's Algorithm
- Best-first
- A* Algorithm

Discrete Planning

- The typical approach towards the problem of path planning assumes a **graph representation** of the terrain. The problem of minimum-path planning on a graph is well known, and a variety of algorithms are applicable under different input specification.
- Therefore path planning problem is handled as a search problem to find the shortest path between start and goal points on a graph.

Discrete Planning

Forward Graph Search Methods/ Enumerative Algorithms

Uninformed/Blind Search

- ♦ Breadth-first (BFS)
- ♦ Depth-first (DFS)
- British Museum Search or Brute-force Search
- ♦ Dijkstra
- ♦.

Informed Search

- ♦ Best-first
- $\diamond A^*$
- ♦ ...

Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning

- Depth-first Search (DFS)
- Dijkstra's Algorithm
- Best-first
- A* Algorithm

Step 1. Form a queue Q and set it to the initial state (for example, the Root).Step 2. Until the Q is empty or the goal state is founddo:

Step 2.1 Determine if the first element in the Q is the goal.

Step 2.2 If it is not

Step 2.2.1 remove the first element in Q.

Step 2.2.2 Apply the rule to generate new state(s) (successor states).

Step 2.2.3 If the new state is the goal state quit and return this state

Step 2.2.4 Otherwise add the new state to the end of the queue.

Step 3. If the goal is reached, success; else failure.

Reading Material

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis

- BFS uses the **queue** as data structure.
- Queue is a First-In-First-Out (FIFO) data structure.
- A FIFO means that the node that has been sitting on the queue for the longest amount of time is the next node to be expanded.







Queue

Start

IN

<u>OUT</u>





Queue

S



<u>OUT</u>

Start

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis









- The path leading to the goal node (E) is traced back up the tree which maps out the directions that the robot must follow to reach the goal.
- Traveling back up the tree,
 we can see that the robot from
 the start would have to go
 south, then south east, then
 east to reach the goal.



Assume that **E** is the goal, Path is: **Start** \rightarrow **S** \rightarrow **SE** \rightarrow **E**

- In BFS, every node generated must remain in memory.
- The number of nodes generated is at most:

O(b^d)

where **b** represents the **maximum branching factor** for each node and **d** is the **depth one must expand to reach the goal**.



Total # of nodes= 2^3 =8

- **Space complexity: O(b**^d**)** (keep every node in memory)
- We can see from this that a for very large workspace where the goal is deep within the workspace, the number of nodes could expand exponentially and demand a very large memory requirement.
- Time Complexity:

$$1+b+b^2+\ldots+b^d=(b^{d+1}-1)/(b-1)=O(b^d)$$

i.e., **exponential** in d.

Depth	Nodes	Tir	me	Memory		Space Complexity			
2	1100	.11 s	seconds	1 megabyte		O(b ^d)			
4	111,100	11 5	seconds 1	06 megabytes					
6	10^{7}	19 1	minutes	10 gigabytes		Time Complexity			
8	10^{9}	31 1	hours	1 terabytes		O(hd)			
10	10^{11}	129 0	days 1	01 terabytes		$O(D^*)$			
12	10^{13}	35 y	years	10 petabytes					
14	10^{15}	3,523	years	1 exabyte					
Figure 3.11 Time and memory requirements for breadth-first search. The numbers shown assume branching factor $b = 10$; 10,000 nodes/second; 1000 bytes/node.									
 Zettabyte: fills the Pacific ocean Exabyte: covers Germany twice 									
Petabyte: covers Manhattan									
• Terabyte: 2 container ships									
Gigabyte: 3 container lorries This is our digital universe today = 250 trillion of DVDs									
• Megabyte:	: 8 bags of rice			Exabyte	10'°	-15			
• Kilobyte: o	cup of rice	1 EB of data is cre The proposed 5	ated on the internet each day = 250 milli Square Kilometer Array telescope will g	on DVDs worth of information. enerated an EB of data per day Terabyte	1012	Petabyte The CERN Large Nadron Collider generates 1PB per second			
• Byte of da	ta: one grain of	rice	500TB of new data per day	are ingested in Facebook databases Megab	10 ⁶	6 Gigabyte Source: Data Science Central			

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis

- ♦ High memory requirement.
- ♦ Exhaustive search as it will process every node.
- ♦ Doesn't get stuck.
- ◊ Finds the shortest path (minimum number of steps).

Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning
- Breadth-first Search (BFS)

- Dijkstra's Algorithm
- Best-first
- A* Algorithm

Step 1. Form a stack S and set it to the initial state (for example, the Root).Step 2. Until the S is empty or the goal state is founddo:

Step 2.1 Determine if the first element in the S is the goal.

Step 2.2 If it is not

Step 2.2.1 Remove the first element in S.

Step 2.2.2 Apply the rule to generate new state(s) (successor states).

Step 2.2.3 If the new state is the goal state quit and return this state

Step 2.2.4 Otherwise add the new state to the beginning of the stack

Step 3. If the goal is reached, success; else failure.

Reading Material

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis

- DFS uses the **stack** as data structure.
- Stack is a Last-In-First-Out (LIFO) data structure.
- The stack contains the list of discovered nodes. The most recent discovered node is put (pushed) on top of the LIFO stack.
- The next node to be expanded is then taken (popped) from the top of the stack and all of its successors are added to the stack.



Stack (LIFO)





L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis









The next node to be expanded would be NE and its successors would be added to the stack and this loop continues until the goal is found.

Once the goal is found, you can then trace
back through the tree to obtain the path for the robot to follow.

- Depth first search usually requires a **considerably less amount of memory** that BFS.
- This is mainly because DFS does not always expand out every single node at each depth.
- However the DFS could continue down an unbounded branch forever even if the goal is not located on that branch.
- Time Complexity: O(b^d) → terrible if d is much larger than b but if solutions are dense, may be much faster than BFS.
- **Space Complexity:** O(bd), i.e., linear space!

- Low memory requirement.
- Full state space search in that every node is processed, i.e, it's **exhaustive** within its set limits.
- Could get stuck exploring infinite paths.
- Used if there are many solutions and you need only one.

• BFS vs. DFS

	BFS	DFS
Space Complexity	More expensive	Less expensive. Requires only O(d) space irrespective of number of children per node.
Time Complexity	More time efficient. A vertex at lower level (closer to the root) is visited first before visiting a vertex that is at higher level (far away from the root)	Less time efficient.

BFS vs. DFS

BFS is preferred if

- ♦ The branching factor is not too large (hence memory costs);
- ♦ A solution appears at a relatively shallow level;
- **Time Complexity:** O(b^d) \diamond No path is excessively deep.

Space Complexity: O(b^d)

DFS is preferred if

- ♦ The tree is deep;
- ♦ Solutions occur deeply in the tree;
- \diamond The branching factor is not excessive.

Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning
- Breadth-first Search (BFS)
- Depth-first Search (DFS)
- <u>Dijkstra's Algorithm</u>
- Best-first
- A* Algorithm

- British Museum Search
 - ♦ Blind search finds only one **arbitrary solution** instead of the optimal solution.
 - To find the optimal solution with DFS or BFS, you must not stop searching when the first solution is discovered. Instead, the search needs to continue until it reaches all the solutions, so you can compare them to pick the best.
 - The strategy for finding the optimal solution is called British
 Museum search or brute-force search.

The inventors called this procedure the British Museum algorithm "... since it seemed to them as sensible as placing monkeys in front of typewriters in order to reproduce all the books in the British Museum [5]."



- Dijkstra's algorithm (**Dynamic Programming**) is a graph search algorithm that solves **the single-source shortest path problem** for a fully connected graph with nonnegative edge path costs, producing a shortest path tree.
- **Dynamic programming** (a fancy name for **divide-andconquer** with a table) approaches are based on the recursive division of a problem into simpler sub-problems.
- Dijkstra's algorithm is **uninformed/blind**, meaning it does not need to know the target node before hand and doesn't use heuristic information.

1. Init

```
Set start distance to 0, dist[s]=0,
```

others to infinite: dist[i]= ∞ (for i \neq s),

Set Ready = $\{\}$.

2. Loop until all nodes are in Ready

Select node n with shortest known distance that is not in Ready set Ready = Ready + $\{n\}$.

 ${\bf FOR}$ each neighbor node m of n

IF dist[n]+edge(n,m) < dist[m] /* shorter path found */

THEN { dist[m] = dist[n]+edge(n,m); pre[m] = n; }

Reading Material

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis



From s to:	S	a	b	C	d
Distance	0	∞	∞	∞	∞
Predecessor	-	-	-	-	-

Step 0: Init list, no predecessors

Ready =
$$\{\}$$

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis



Step 1: Closest node is s, add to Ready

Update distances and pred. to all neighbors of *s*, **Ready = {S**}


Step 2: Next closest node is c, add to Ready Update distances and pred. for a and d, **Ready = {S, c}**



Step 3: Next closest node is d, add to Ready Update distance and pred. for b. Ready = {s, c, d}



From s to:	S	a])	С	d
Distance	0	8	13	9	5	7
Predecessor	_	С	¢	a	S	C

Step 4: Next closest node is a, add to Ready Update distance and pred. for b. Ready = {S, a, c, d}



From s to:	S	a	b	C	d
Distance	0	8	9	5	7
Predecessor	_	С	a	S	С

Step 5: Closest node is b, add to Ready check all neighbors of s. Ready = {S, a, b, c, d} **complete!**



- \diamond dist[a] = 8
- \Rightarrow pre[a] = c
- \Rightarrow pre[c] = S
- ♦ Shortest path: S→c →a,
- ♦ Length is 8

From s to:	S	a	b	C	d
Distance	0	8	9	5	7
Predecessor	_	С	a	S	С

Shortest path between s and a is $\{S, c, a\} \Rightarrow length=8$



- ◊ dist[b] = 9
- \Rightarrow pre[b] = a
- \Rightarrow pre[a] = c
- \Rightarrow pre[c] = S

♦ Shortest path: S→c →a →b

From s to:	S	a	b	C	d
Distance	0	8	9	5	7
Predecessor	_	С	a	S	С

Shortest path between s and b is $\{S, c, a, b\} \Rightarrow length=9$



- dist[c] = 5
- \Rightarrow pre[c] = S
- ♦ Shortest path: $S \rightarrow c$

From s to:	S	a	b	С	d
Distance	0	8	9	5	7
Predecessor	_	С	a	S	C

Shortest path between s and d is $\{S, c\} \Rightarrow length=5$



- dist[d] = 7
- \Rightarrow pre[d] = c
- \Rightarrow pre[c] = S
- ♦ Shortest path: S→c →d

From s to:	S	a	b	С	d
Distance	0	8	9	5	7
Predecessor	_	С	a	S	С

Shortest path between s and d is $\{S, c, d\} \Rightarrow length=7$

As can be seen from previous example, instead of solving subproblems recursively, solve them sequentially and store their solutions in a table. The trick is to solve them in the right order so that whenever the solution to a subproblem is needed, it is already available in the table [I. Parberry. *Problems on algorithms*. Prentice-Hall, 1995].

Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning
- Breadth-first Search (BFS)
- Depth-first Search (DFS)
- Dijkstra's Algorithm

• <u>Best-first</u>

• A* Algorithm

- 1. Workspace discretized into cells
- 2. Insert (x_{init},y_{init}) into list OPEN
- **3. Find** all **8-way neighbors** to (x_{init},y_{init}) that have not been previously visited and insert into OPEN
- 4. Sort neighbors by minimum potential
- **5.** Form paths from neighbors to (x_{init}, y_{init})
- **6. Delete** (x_{init},y_{init}) from OPEN
- 7. $(x_{init}, y_{init}) = minPotential(OPEN)$

8. GOTO 2 until (x_{init}, y_{init}) =goal (SUCCESS) or OPEN empty (FAILURE)

Reading Material

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis





































- ♦ It is a kind or **mixed depth and breadth first** search.
- ♦ Adds the successors of a node to the expand list.
- All nodes on the list are sorted according to the **heuristic** values.
- ♦ Expand **most desirable unexpanded** node.
- ♦ Special Case: **A***.

Outline

- Introductory Concepts
- Discrete Planning
- Breadth-first Search (BFS)
- Depth-first Search (DFS)
- Dijkstra's Algorithm
- Best-first
- <u>A* Algorithm</u>

Pronounced "**A-Star**"; heuristic algorithm for computing the **shortest path** from one given **start node** to one given **goal node**.

The A^{*} search algorithm is a variant of dynamic programming (Dijkstra) that tries to **reduce the total number of states explored** by incorporating a **heuristic estimate** of the cost to get the goal from a given state.

- 1. Use a queue to store all the partially expanded paths.
- 2. Initialize the queue by adding to the queue a zero length path from the root node to nowhere.

3. Repeat

Examine the first path on the queue.

If it reaches the goal node then success.

Else {continue search}

Remove the first path from the queue.

Expand the last node on this path by one step.

Calculate the cost of these new paths.

Add these new paths to the queue.

Reading Material

L8, SPC418: Autonomous Vehicles Design and Control- Zewail City of Science and Technology - Fall 2016 © Dr. Alaa Khamis

Sort the queue in ascending order according to the sum of the cost of the expanded path and the estimated cost of the remaining path for each path.

If more than one path reaches a subnode

Then delete all but the minimum cost path.

Until the goal has been found or the queue is empty.

4. If the goal has been found return success and the path, otherwise return failure.

Reading Material



Source: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:Astar_progress_animation.gif

-

- This algorithm may look complex since there seems to be the need to store incomplete paths and their lengths at various places.
- However, using a **recursive best-first search** implementation can solve this problem in an elegant way without the need for explicit path storing.
- The quality of the lower bound goal distance from each node greatly influences the timing complexity of the algorithm.
- The closer the given lower bound is to the true distance, the shorter the execution time.

References

- 1. LaValle, S. M. (2006). Planning algorithms. Cambridge university press.
- 2. van Wezel, W., Jorna, R. J., & Meystel, A. M. (Eds.). (2006). *Planning in Intelligent Systems: Aspects, motivations, and methods*. John Wiley & Sons.
- 3. Spong, M. W., Hutchinson, S., & Vidyasagar, M. *Robot modeling and control*. John Wiley & Sons, 2006.
- 4. Siegwart, R., Nourbakhsh, I. R., & Scaramuzza, D.(2011). *Introduction to autonomous mobile robots*. MIT press.
- 5. Crina Grosan and Ajith Abraham. *Intelligent Systems: A Modern Approach*. Springer, 2011.
- 6. <u>http://dasl.mem.drexel.edu/Hing/BFSDFSTutorial.htm</u>, Last accessed: November 20, 2016.